Balinese music-making as rhizome? ne *triangga* form comprises a tripartite Such appeals to structural unity and the ructure of kawitan - pengawak - pengecet 'formalism' that McPhee treasured in his A reassessment of pokok as 'core melody', is introductory passage — slow tempo, 'To use a Balinese To provide a brief window into upported by another key piece of terminology us beloved *gong gede* of course bleed easily into metaphor, fixed xtended middle section — faster the sometimes far-fetched world by Balinese gamelan musicians but rarely included However, my discussions with another vocabulary popular among colonialoncluding section, often collectively elaborations are like the of musicology, this claim was later In A Thousand Plateaus Deleuze and Guattari in musicological texts: bun gending. Bun may be elderly gamelan gong luang playe era ethnographers, governors and certain termed KPP) as a model for composition leaves and flowers of a countered by Burnham who outline how the rhizome might be embodied in Anak Agung Suma saw the term translated as a climbing plant or creeper, in high-caste figures on Bali - a vocabulary that The KPP form is widely depicted as tree, the branches, limbs, pokok being deployed quite particular its stem (Shadeg 2007: 52). However, suggested that if sonata form was musical terms. They discuss the Western tonal fuels cultural policy on Bali up to the present We're tired of trees (part II). differently - to designate a mucl rather than referring to an isolated component of th trunk, and roots of which iginating in court genres, Tenzer statin once understood as analogous to system as assuming an aborescent model of day: that of 'unity', 'harmony' and 'balance' n extended botanical footnote broader, holistic structure, one musical structure, or the idea of this stem linking t are the underlying that the form was 'originally applied to the relationship between the sexes thought: it is fixed and linear. The alternative, fusicological texts tend to invok determined not by melody but l single and distinct strand of the musical texture, by McPhee was eager to cite gamelan's 'perfect melodic and colotomic lambatan in pegongan and pegambuhan the form does not necessarily larger-scale metrical repeats. ne *pokok* (variously glossed as the gending refers to the general contours and flow of the superlinear 'rhizome' is accomplished by what balance' of form by which it achieves its [gong-pattern] pertories... [It] evolved during the core melody', 'the root' or 'trunk' equate to an unequal power work, inclusive of all its various components. While D&G refer to as 'generalized chromaticism' structural unity - and along with a host of strata' (Tenzer 2000: 209) of almost any given Balinese in need of further study, the idea that *pokok* may relation but rather a 'love golden age of court culture and was which affects 'not only pitches but all 'sound other writers, noted how this was mirrored gamelan piece as its central centra refer rather to a musical whole instead of a single relationship' (1996: 182). handed down orally and though components—durations, intensities, timbre, structural tenet (see McPhee 1966) extracted melodic entity could have intriguing in the social organisation of Bali's musicpropagation in compositional Seebass 1990, Tenzer 2000) implications for the musicological study of Balines attacks—it becomes impossible to speak of a making and indeed across Balinese life more practice' (2000: 354). sound form organizing matter; it is no longer generally (McPhee 1966: 111). The pernicious An account published in even possible to speak of a **continuous** backdrop to 'steady state Bali' and the development of form.' (Deleuze and Guattari Bhawanagara in 1934 by mysterious political agenda behind the various hymns to (presumed) Balinese writer 'Balyson' 'We're tired of trees. We should stop believin Balinese 'balance' have been explored suggest the more precise, theoretical Returning to sonata form, one compares the 'soon forgotten' new in trees, roots, and radicles. They've made us elsewhere - but in summary, we find the ormulization of this three-part structure to be a particularly delicious exposé of suffer too much... Thought is not arborescent works of *kebyar* with the grandeur of enunciation of musical structure deployed as Kontemporer composers later development. McGraw suggests its arrival musicological 'abstraction' as far fron Balinese-authored Bhawanagara article of 1934, the *gong gede* repertoire. Balyson draws and the brain is not a rooted or ramified keen to muffle or upturn a means of asserting political control. (as an articulated construct) to coincide with the sociologically 'pure' has been offered On asking experimental composer I Madé Arnawa matter.' (D&G 1987: 15). distinction between the intense 'Soeling, rebab and genggong' by 'KWN' presents a notion of musical form advent of Bali's music institutions in the late by feminist musicologist Susan nelodic elaboration or flowering striking structural hierarchy between *kebyar* and and/or blur seemingly whether audiences are surprised (heran) if the 1960s, understood as deriving from gong gedé but McClary in her *Feminine Endings* kembang) found within kebyar music 'court' music. 'KWN' celebrates the grass-roots distinct musical genres or 'classic' triangga structure is changed in a gong becoming a widespread compositional tool for (1991). McClary takes to task the Music has always sent out lines of s played by the gangsa, and what he origins of *kebyar*, considering first the *rebab* and *suling* ong kebyar through the works of I Wayan longstanding analytical responses to In turn, McPhee laments the rise of *kebyar* for terms the 'lagoe (gending)', which can and their long standing associations with the court Beratha, and McGraw also proposes the concept to the form, highlighting the gendered light, like so many "transformational its lack of form: be glossed alternately as melody or through their use in *gamelan gambuh* ensembles (1934: be 'only partially supported by actual musical There are numerous examples of Critical musicology has revoked the language used to label the component 'They're aghast! [kaget] ... and often I hear: 146). However, KWN then states their usage to be in 'composition', but here seems to refer However, McClary suggests evidence' (2005: 53-4). Indeed, the location of three omposers juxtaposing different 'black box' status of much of sonata form (it has been customary decline, and suggests that when we would do better "What kind of music is this? Does it comply The beauty, the strength the artistic to a 'core melody' of music upon multiplicities," even overturning the the music might still have discrete parts is regularly contradicted in the ensembles and repertoires in a 'It is because genres exist as an institution nusicological discourse on Wester since the nineteenth-century to denote to attribute the origins of *kebyar* not to these courtly which these elaborations rest. Balyson significance of Balinese music lay in its with the 'statement'?' ... Why do we return lots to say to us, if analysed analysis of professed KPP works, be they 'classic' notably combative manner: see for that they function as 'horizons of classical music, highlighting ho the first theme or subject group as suggests that if one attempts to listen formalism...but in the past twenty years a forms but rather 'let us listen carefully to the situation with the right sort of care and to these ordinary ideas? I want to jump to very codes that structure or arborify nstance Wayan Sudirana's *Kreasi* 4 elambatan or new tabuh kréasi. expectation' for readers and 'models of any such accounts are wholly masculine and the second subject as new form, known as the *kebyar* style, feverish to all of the gangsa 'kembang', it will in the villages!' (marilah kita mendengar-dengar keadaan contextual sensitivity. She (2009) that dynamically pits [4culturally mediated. As neatly writing' for authors. (Todorov 1990: 18) feminine). McClary proposes that this wherever. I tip over [obrak-abrik] those not be possible to hear the *gending* and melodramatic, has suddenly arisen out desa-desa!) (1934: 146). KWN suggests it is not so proposes that the project of it; that is why musical form, right toned] angklung against [5-toned] ımmarised by Burnham: no ana practice sees the first subject serve the 'structures'. (pers. comm. 2008) of the old... Tradition has been thrown itself (kita tidak mendengar lagoe much the sounds of gamelan gambuh and semar critical musicology is 'to gamelan gong kebyar narrative function of protagonist/hero can resist 'the urge to idealize r Adorno — arguably musical dialectic's mos overboard and law and order discarded for (gending)), suggesting a sense of loss pegulingan that have formed the basis for these new examine the ways in which down to its ruptures and musical practice in ways congruer while the second theme assumes that uential proponent — Beethoven's approach to (1934: 164). Here the value of *kebyar* is innovations, which, though at times beautifu compositions, but techniques derived from the different musics [themselves with one's world view' (Burnham of the female Other, constructed as the nata form, the apex of 'absolute music', held a claimed to be diminished through its village-based *genggong*, the bamboo mouth-harp in themselves, can in the end lead only to Contemporary composers in Bali as D&G's articulate the priorities and 1993: 77). proliferations is comparable to a foil which must be contained and eep affinity with Hegel's approach to dialectic: empty aimless forms of expression.' (McPhee composers relegating the 'core' of the which has been imitated (ditiru). KWN notes the use nomads (1987) in both musical and extravalues of various \_\_\_\_\_ subdued, so that tonal order (a return How might radical (and otherwise) Genre as **social practice**. Tony Bennett musical structure. of bamboo in instrument-making by the Balinese race musical terms? Often working within given Composer I Gede Arsana communities' (1991: 26) to the home key) can be achieved. weed, a **rhizome**.' (Deleuze and writes of how genres exist as 'modes of ne fungibility of all individual thematic elements well before the coming of bronze gamelan technology [musical] structures or 'points' (i.e. the Balinese composers enact a complex gave the following [see commentary on bun gending in the sociality... account must also be taken of n autonomous music is compared to Hegel's (krawang), and so celebrates the long-standing, preexpectation of nominally adhering to the form of musical argument or private account about hi In discussing the 'state of play' of gamelan in rhizome section as a counter to this the organisation of the specific Guattari, 1987: 11-12) refusal to allow an external limit to be set to Majapahit precedent to the structures of Balinese triangga structure in compositions) but resistance to state-sanctioned Bali, I Wayan Sinti saw what he perceived as [covertly] experimental institutional frameworks conditioning the thought, his refusal to allow a being which canno exploring the space between points wherever music-making. musical structures and genres in 2010 tabuh kreasi: 'you a decline of 'traditional' forms to be deployment of literary texts in order to be thought. Just as all themes must be developed in 'There are knots of their works? can't hear my piece if destroying the entire edifice (pohon-pohonnya) assess the regions of socilaity to which, at Beethoven, so all supposedly brute individual you think of it as a kreasi of Balinese music. the time, they were concretely connected facts must be shown to be entangled in thinking for baru' (in McGraw 2013 aborescence in rhizomes and within which the operated — as parts Hegel. The insistence that all thematic material 92) 'Gambuh, gambang, gender wayang: of **technologies of self-formation**, nation must be worked on developed is compared to 'Many kontemporer artists understood democracy not these are the source [sumbernya], the Hegel's emphasis on 'the labour of the concept' formation, for instance, or as combinations The nomad has a territory; he follows customary s a homogenous, harmonious state, but one in and rhizomatic trees. If this is the source, the others "What is called music today is of these.' (1990: 110-11) Finally, and most importantly, the hope for a hich **antagonisms** constantly emerge to be drawn paths; he goes from one point to another; he is no [other geres of gamelan] form the Or to adapt the question Mark poses in all too often only a disguise for The "Critical Musicology" movement into debate, a world in which conflict is sustained, coercionless identity of form and material is ignorant of points (water points, dwelling points, Kebyar celebrated by some Westeren branches, the leaves, the flowers, the II. Kebyar as connecting to the his paper: under what circumstances the monologue of power... has since **challenged** the myth of ompared to Hegel's hope for a coercionless offshoots in roots.' might argument be 'musically audible' Music has neither meaning nor **absolute music**. As summarised by identity and non-identity' (Jarvis 1998: 120). official aesthetics' (McGraw 2013: xxvii). nomad life is a **principle** and what is only a burnt down [terbakarnya]' (Pers. Comm., tenets declare its jaba roots, stification for [musical] modernism. rather than articulable in Bali? Kramer, the unending discussions consequence. To begin with, although the points I Wayan Sinti, 2008) bypassing the strictures of ovarrubias celebrates kebyar's (Attali [1977] (1985): 9, 25) (Deleuze and Guattari urrounding the idea of 'autonomou determine paths, they are strictly subordinated to bronze, classical [triwangsa] tricately interlocking patterns as music' has in many ways proved I. Kebyar as 'inferior' musical the paths they determine, the reverse happens with III. Kebyar apparently But this process is not the same as **imitation**: 'if form. (cf Surya Kanta kind of bronze counterpoint, aligning ruitless, because **it is not so much** form due to apparent lack of the sedentary. The water point is reached only in Music is 'the active, creative 1987: 20) the sound block has a becoming-animal as its supports prevailing wind o kebyar with the master of form in about the nature of music "itself" (as 'structural' solidity. order to be left behind; every point is a relay and operation that consists in content, then the animal simultaneously Western musical modernism Western Art Music, J.S. Bach himself The performance whipped if there were such a thing) as about the exists only as a relay. A path is always between tw The 20th century absolute deterritorializing the becomes, in sonority, something else...certainly describing kebyar as an 'ultra-modern certain ISI faculty members ways we **authorise** ourselves to listen points, but the in-between has taken on all the Sauman burst onto the *musik* ot a generality or a simplification (D&G 1987: music debate (head east or refrain' (D&G 1987: 369). Bach fugue' (1937: 207). into such moral outrage to music and to talk about it.' (2002: 1 consistency and enjoys both an autonomy and a kontemporer scene with Geräusci this chart for background on Without wading too far into the dense that subsequent cohorts direction of its own. The life of the nomad is the ('noise') (2006) produced for his terrain of literature on 'sonata have been subject to intermezzo... the nomad goes from point to poin ISI ujian - a work of fabulous form' (see Tovey 1949, Rosen 1980, considerably stricter only as a consequence and as a factual iconoclasm. The work's climax Webster 1980) the notion of 'dialectic Claims as to what *kebyar*'s censure in their production. necessity.' (D&G 1987: 380) features the composer applying Chanda Klang as embedded within sonata form musical structure argues a hammer and furiously loud derives from the presence of the two diverge [wildly] according to by Sang Nyoman Arsawijaya Windu Sara by I Wayan Sinti electric grinder to what is distinct musical 'groups' (which might socio-political agenda. [recording to follow] [recording to follow] widely held as the gamelan's be two single themes or two \_\_\_\_ most sacred component, a collections of musical material). This narrative was however not just articulated See I Nyoman Mariyana's Tawur (2007), a highly-During the 'exposition' passage of the yy colonial administrators but upheld by many **Sonata form arrives.** It is widely successful ISI *ujian* submission (it scored the movement, the first of these groups is held to have marked a shift in within Bali's high caste communities through highest mark of the cohort) accompanied by a The explosive rise and popularity of the heard in the tonic (the 'home key') and he sudden production of (somewhat music's communicative capacities: skripsi offering a particularly strong blend of nercurial *gamelan gong kebyar* alongside the the second is heard in another key chronologically hazy) lontar documents An example of D&G's 'deterritorialization' - where 'rhetorical' power is here replaced Balinese 'mysticism' and a range of Western Perhaps an example of D&G's 'imitation': the 'refrain' Surya Kanta movement = powerful foil to (usually chord V or the 'dominant'). the refrain is any kind of musical pattern that outlining the complex, esoteric tenets of such by that of the 'dialectic'. terms and reference points which sought to here has been flattened rather than freed - its existing this veneration of courtly forms. A kind of There tends to follow a busy and often marks out a territory and the composer's music whose performance, it transpires, must be quantify, contain and assert meaning across the codes have just been ossified rather than given flight. nusical protest in itself? Balinese accounts o turbulent development section before restricted to those of higher castes. By finding 'becoming bird' then **decodes** that marker. The 'argument' which unfolds composition. The work itself contained various gong kebyar during the colonial era show the concluding recapitulation, where new ways to preserve (or construct) exclusive across a sonata form movement is bits of submerged musical irreverence including similarly politic uses for musical 'structure' the first subject group returns esoteric 'knowledge' via the comprehension o played out via two opposing a passage which was openly (and mischievously) ither denigrating kebyar for its lack of alongside the second subject group subjects which eventually various musical structures, this group found referred to in rehearsal as 'salsa' and which lilted 'classical' formal clarity, or overtly Well-known musical conservative which is now heard also in the tonic or one means to preserve an otherwise dwindling alongside a 'ponggang' refrain (from the gamelan celebrating this music's roots in other composed *Windu Sara* to be performe power supply. beleganjur repertoire) in rehearsal - but was on the composer's newly-created Chanda Klang was composed as the tabuh reframed as a simple embellishment of the gamelan siwa nada, an ensemble kréasi for the Kodya (Denpasar) entry for 'ponggang' in the work's accompanying skripsi. featuring specially-made bamboo and the 2007 Festival Gong Kebyar by bronze instruments derived from enowned (and occasionally infamous) gamelan gambang and pelégongan nusik kontemporer composer Sang Nyomai respectively and tuned to a highly Arsawijaya (hereafter known as Sauman) as colonial rule commences, supported b Γhis musicological deterrorialising unusual nine-tone scale. the assertion that Bali's ancient Majapahi This lefthand-side tree is a brief/preliminary proved disconcerting for certain Gangsa alit
Ponggang exercise in Collingwood's historical method of eritage was in need of preservation, the Balinese authority figures, thoug 'ancient' forms of gamelan gambuh and it 'reenactment' (here looking at how musical who saw the attendant lack of allegedly] coherent modal systems structure was framed in colonial-era Bali) — 'structure' (both in the piece's whereby analysis of authorship is conducted by known as patutan...] and neat, ourportedly 'Western' and 'Balines symmetrical gong structures are upheld a interrogating the classificatory or categorizing traits) to be something of a threat The piece generated minor controversy, evidence of Bali's courtly pedigree by the modes employed, or, in other words, the 'recovery The ensemble was manufactured in America during Sinti's being termed too complex and dvancing Dutch (and certain high-caste of absolute presuppositions' (see Boucher's professional residency in 2005 at the University of 'academic' (terlalu akademis) for introduction to Collingwood 1999: xxx). See also Balinese). Mysterious discovery of Aji Washington, Seattle. Following Sinti's return to Bali, the nainstream audiences and thus, idea of enunciation, which I use in a Foucauldian Gurnita lontar, framing courtly forms as Seattle group planned a trip to Bali in 2007 and Sinti pparently lacked 'musical feeling' (r xclusive privilege of triwangsa. Balinese sense to describe a particularly authoritative form nanufactured a second siwa nada ensemble, having applied Sauman's own definition of a canon musikal) for certain members of the musical tradition as commodity now of articulation, e.g. where the 'enunciative The late eighteenth century saw the rise of 'absolute' music concurs with the Western notion (not least for and obtained a **prestigious PKB performance** for the modality' again operates through incommensurate judging panel. music that is claimed to be 'autonomous, self-contained and group. This performance was given not only by Sinti and the because his canonic writing has been the distinct elements', between which is established ' wholly self referential' (Bonds 2014: 1). Composers' interest in subject of considerable research scrutiny) Seattle group, but the ensemble also comprised a number of system of relations that is not 'really' given or music nominally of and for only itself saw the associated experienced Balinese musicians of Sinti's acquaintance plus and states the device to be where 'one Cor anglais solo constituted a priori' but is effected by discourse development of a range of **new musical forms**. several other Western musicians on Bali (the author included [melody] begins and another starts at a (1972: 55). Early encounters between Westerners The group performed to an equally international audience at different time [but with] the same and with Balinese music see it the PKB, yielding considerable acclaim. melody' (satu melodi mulai dan lainnya Further to this: could the musical forms themselves described as 'clangour and From here, Baroque composers developed the idea of mulai dalam waktu berbeda, melodi yang tell us anything? — how might we examine the noise' (Friederich 1959 [1849-50]: 97 Bach composing his Trio Sonata in C (H 597) for two The Western musical technique Chanda Klang Sauman stated that his aim [themselves] articulate the priorities and values of The apparent lack of 'musical of a canon is based on the violins, subtitled 'a Conversation between a Cheerful was only to create the impression or One such 'academic' idea various communities' (McClary 1991: 26). I am structure' in Bali used as further proof principle of imitation, where a Man [Sanguineus] and a Melancholy Man 'character' (*sifatnya aja*) of a canon: it was was the use of a musical tentative to attempt this on 'historical forms' of Bali's inherent barbarity. melody is imitated after a [Melancholius], where the two men (cast as the paired not 'exact' (persis) (pers. comm. 2007). 'canon' within the piece. The work notably employs a without consultation with composers etc. - unlike specific time interval by one or violins) are set in characterful opposition, as defined Throughout Europe, there emerged a growing emphasis on Western classical melody in its the rhizome to the right where it feels more There has followed an exhausting and more parts, either at the same by somewhat caricatured contrasts in tempo, tonality the musical text expression (i.e. the idea of musical 'word central section: the theme from the possible, it seems much too risky here (see the complex debate on music/language and or a different pitch. and phrasing. painting' in the setting of lyrics), while German composers slow movement of Dvorák's New paragraph above!) - but it'd be good to discuss music/meaning which weaves through and theorists developed a systematic code of "musical World Symphony. just about the entirety of Western rhetoric" corresponding to contemporary linguistic discipline musicology. Theorists across various (Bartel 2003: 57). German theoretician Joachim Burmeister disciplines have considered music as on formalised a theory of music predicated on the techniques of or other kind of 'language', be it Levirhetoric in his 1606 Musica Poetica, guiding composers in Strauss' 'language without meaning' (1981: 647), Barthes' 'second Suling 2

Suling 2

Jegog Sauman's canon soon 'took flight' '[putting] together a musical piece by combining melodi order' language (1967) or Cooke's seminal Sinti replicates the soft dynamic and steady from the formal definition of a canon. lines into a harmony adorned with various affections of tempo of the Dvorák but Sinti's representatior and controversial The Language of Music The melodic shape of the two suling periods, in order to incline men's minds and hearts to otherwise identifies the Dvorák passage solely (1959) which provides a kind of 'lexicon lines are closely imitative but quickly various emotions.' ([1606] 1993: 13) through its basic melodic outline: the melody of musical affect, proposing that all tonal liverge from a strict canon - for 9 10 12 13 s stripped down to a set of skeleton tones music uses the same, or closely similar, instance, the second entry rapidly which are rearranged into new phrase melodic phrases, harmonies, and rhythm alters the melody by omitting structures and organised with a new to affect the listener in the same ways. elaborating notes and at the second iniformity of rhythm; apart from the first Powers (1980) highlights the prevalence of held 'A' (dang) deducts a further halfphrase, Sinti's passage is comprised primarily beat to shrink the lines' rhythmic language models in the analysis of of melodic statements of four single-beat notes European music, while Agawu (2014) Sauman commenting on his creative process The idea of Western classical ollowed by a sustained four-beat tone.  $\nearrow$  provides an insightful summary of the and structural concerns in composing Candra music as a form of **rhetoric** (in the The free use of 'canon' drew criticism from Musical material 'imitated' for its sociosemiotic 'adventures' of music from the Aristotelian sense of 'persuasion') older, now more conservative composer I political efficacy. Windu Sara gains from Greeks to the present day. See also Kramer dominated musical composition Ketut Gede Asnawa, who worried for the the particular 'ethnological (2002) and Bonds (2014). 'I didn't think that much about the piece and analysis across the early structural authenticity of this usage: 'when valence' (Miller 2006: 5) of Western actually, I just let it flow, and I didn't think people adopt a system from Western music, modern period. classical music while also asserting much about the structure of the probably they just understand the skin of 'Balineseness' in performance. Both **composition**. At the beginning I just had a it.' (pers. comm 2007) aspects prove an important means of little bit of a 'concept': the canon... I really n conversation, Sinti predicated the value of promoting the ensemble and Sinti's work like it, most of [my compositions] have a within these two specific performance his new gamelan siwa nada on the ensemble's canon in them.' (pers. comm. Sauman 2007) contexts (Seattle and the PKB). -tone tuning system, offering a polished and mprehensive account of his devising thes Asnawa's concern over clarity and musical intervals based on a blend of mathematics Tracing Western Art Music back to boundaries heightened considerably when he gama Hindu and his own personal rasa. its literally **classical roots**, the discussed what he perceived as a lack of structure in Rehearsal sessions evidenced an alternative, ancient Greeks designated music highly pragmatic approach to the origins and and language with the single word workings of this tuning system. ['[Sauman] tells me there is the *triangga* [the alleged musiké (Neubauer 1986: 22). 'traditional' three-part structure of so-called *klasik* repertoire] concept in it, but if you listen the first time you couldn't find it. This part the kawitan, this part the body [pengawak], this part the pengecet? So, this is now a problem: we should be trying to clarify it. He said the structure is there: he feels it. He uses it, the concept, because he wants to... [have] something

as a fundamental idea. But, like I said... the young people try to make such complicated things...' ([in

English] pers. comm. 2007)